

AUGUST 2013

MEGACITIES

**CRAIG FAIRNINGTON &
JOEL COHEN**



DEBATING MATTERS
**TOPIC
GUIDES**

www.debatingmatters.com

MOTION:

**“MEGACITIES ARE
BAD FOR THE
DEVELOPING WORLD”**

wellcometrust
Strategic Award

PRIMARY FUNDER



HEADLINE SPONSOR

LLOYDS
SCHOLARS

TOPIC GUIDE SPONSORS



THINK BIG. THEN THINK BIGGER.

Lloyds Scholars is a unique social mobility programme run by Lloyds Banking Group. Partnering with leading universities across the UK, we offer students from lower income households a complete package of financial support, paid internships, a business mentor and the opportunity to develop their employability skills.

For more information visit:

 www.lloyds-scholars.com  @LloydsScholars



UNIVERSITY OF
BIRMINGHAM



The
University
Of
Sheffield.

THE UNIVERSITY OF
WARWICK

CONTENTS

Introduction

Key terms

The megacities debate in context

Essential reading

Backgrounders

Organisations

In the news

KEY TERMS

Garden City

Megacity

Urban sprawl

Urban Upgrading

INTRODUCTION

1 of 6

NOTES

1
1
2
4
5
5
6

A ‘megacity’ is typically defined as an urban area with over 10 million inhabitants. In 1950, the New York metropolitan area was the only city to meet this criterion. Today, an estimated 1 in 5 people live in one of 27 megacities around the globe – the largest being Tokyo with a population of 36 million [Ref: [Slate](#)]. The UN expects this number to have reached 37 by 2025 with the majority of growth coming from an ascendant developing world, particularly Asia [Ref: [United Nations](#)]. The general move towards urban living – with a projected 60% of the world’s population living in cities by 2030 [Ref: [Forbes](#)] – has led some commentators to worry that the future’s megacities will look vastly different to New York, Tokyo or London, resembling Mumbai or São Paulo with their vast slums and associated social, health and environmental problems [Ref: [Moscow Times](#)]. Others however suggest that the challenges presented by megacities can be overcome with architectural and technical ingenuity, the economic dynamism of city life and the promise of a better standard of living for all. In essence, megacities are either dynamic hotbeds of productivity or corrupt and frightening expanses of urban blight.

Cities of slums

In 1971, around 1 in 6 Mumbai residents lived in slums. Today, the slum population stands at around 1 in 2 (8.7 million slum-dwellers in a population of 18.5 million) [Ref: [Times of India](#)]. This is not unique to Mumbai; many megacities in Asia, Africa and South America have vast populations living in slums with little or no government provision for essential infrastructure like sanitation, electricity, safe transport links and education. In the eyes of some researchers, the widespread belief in “gigantism for its own sake” [Ref: [Forbes](#)] is unnecessarily forcing millions to live in unpleasant conditions that cause and exacerbate common health problems like high rates of disease, lower than average life expectancies, epidemics and even pandemics of communicable diseases [Ref: [NEJM](#)]. Why, they ask, should emerging megacities tragically repeat the worst mistakes of mass urbanisation that once occurred in the West? While even the most ardent of advocates for megacities recognise that sprawling, unplanned developments may look chaotic to a planner’s eye, hopeful observers argue that the challenge of large, concentrated urban populations will not lead to poverty, but to innovative solutions. These commentators often celebrate the ‘DIY spirit’ of slums that are “improved steadily and gradually by their residents” [Ref: [Prospect](#)]. They suggest that complex and constantly changing megacities demonstrate daily how improvements to the living conditions of slum-dwellers are not only possible but inevitable. Many look to China where the number of urban slum-dwellers fell by 25% from 2000-2008 [Ref: [spiked](#)] and where planning and investment is allowing the country to build the world’s largest megacity in the Pearl River Delta – not as a single sprawl, but as a cluster of separate, inter-

connected urban hubs [Ref: [Atlantic](#)]. Some research has also raised doubts over the evidence that living in a smaller city will necessarily improve one’s quality of life [Ref: [Vox](#)].

Lure of the city

For these advocates poverty in the developing world’s megacities is not the fault of geographical factors like size and scale but are the result of endemic political corruption and decades of poor planning. While conditions in the slums may admittedly be terrible they are often better than the areas migrant workers left behind offering a first step in the climb out of poverty [Ref: [Economic Times](#)]. As American economist, Edward Glaeser, suggests, there are both social and economic advantages to city life: “slums don’t make people poor, they attract poor people who want to be rich”, he says [Ref: [Forbes](#)]. The economic sense of megacities – offering the prospect of more jobs, better wages, cheap access to labour-saving ‘mod-cons’ that once were the preserve of the rich – has further contributed to their appeal. Accordingly, the United Nations are clear on the developmental benefits of city living finding that education, healthcare and other services can be easily distributed amongst those in dense areas [Ref: [United Nations](#)]. For these reasons recent protests in Turkey, Brazil, Africa and across the Middle East have been described as particularly urban movements reflecting the aspirations of a new, well educated and growing middle class [Ref: [Financial Times](#)]. However, as critics of megacities point out, political representation in the developing world often struggles to keep up with the size, transformation and population growth of modern metropolises [Ref: [Business Daily](#)] producing more potentially explosive inter-city tensions than

THE MEGACITIES DEBATE IN CONTEXT CONTINUED...

3 of 6

NOTES

solidarities [Ref: [Foreign Policy](#)]. Megacities in the developing world are undoubtedly more unstable and certainly more unpredictable than their counterparts in the Western world. In return for the promise of a better life, can the concentration of power in sprawling cities do anything but politically exclude and economically impoverish the countryside that surrounds them? [Ref: [Global Asia](#)]. Research by the McKinsey Global Institute suggests that bloated urban behemoths may become a drag on emerging economies [Ref: [Economist](#)] while investment flows towards more secure and manageable medium-sized cities [Ref: [Daily Nation](#)]. If they are right, the future of megacities might look more like a poverty trap absorbing the aspirations of the poor while mostly benefitting the rich [Ref: [New Statesman](#)].

ESSENTIAL READING

The Rise of the Megacity

David Pilling *Slate* 5 November 2011

Restricting the growth of cities will improve quality of life

Economist January 2011

FOR

Megacities face Mega Problems

Moscow Times 26 June 2012

City Limits

Economist 13 August 2011

The problem with megacities

Joel Kotkin *Forbes* 4 April 2011

Urbanization – An emerging humanitarian disaster

Ronak B. Patel and Thomas F. Burke *New England Journal of Medicine* 20 August 2009

AGAINST

The century of the city will change the way we do politics

John Rossant *Financial Times* 24 June 2013

Slums are hubs of hope, progress and dignity

Swaminathan S Anklesaria Aiyar *Economic Times* 31 March 2013

Liberated from the “idiocy of rural life”

Patrick Hayes *spiked* 31 January 2012

New Land Of Opportunity

Edward Glaeser *Forbes* 20 April 2011

IN DEPTH

How the rise of the megacity is changing the way we live

Paul Webster and Jason Burke *Guardian* 21 January 2012

Megacities: Scars on the Earth, or Keys to Growth?

NPR 12 December 2011

Behold the countryside: the urban/rural divide

Tay Kheng Soon *Global Asia* 2008

4 of 6

NOTES

BACKGROUNDERS

5 of 6

NOTES

Why Kenya should act fast to address social inequalities in growing slums

Kennedy Odede *Business Daily* 5 August 2013

Failed city? Karachi's violent spiral

Foreign Policy 9 April 2013

'Africa Is a Great Country'

Jens Assur *Foreign Policy* April 2013

Megacities: soulless sprawl or shining future?

Carl Björkman *World Economic Forum* 23 January 2013

Too big to flood? Megacities face a future of major storm risks

Bruce Stutz *Guardian* 17 December 2012

'One Mega-City, Many Systems': The Evolution of Hong Kong

Parag Khanna & Thomas Sevcik *Atlantic* 21 June 2012

Slumlands — filthy secret of the modern mega-city

Paul Mason *New Statesman* 8 August 2011

Are the world's megacities too big?

Klaus Desmet & Esteban Rossi-Hansber *Vox* 12 March 2011

How Slums Can Save the Planet

Stewart Brand *Prospect* 27 January 2010

Unleashing the potential of Urban Growth

UNFPA 2007

India's pop-up mega city

Financial Times

'Cities on the Edge: Megacities'

Andrew Marr *BBC* (via YouTube)

ORGANISATIONS

McKinsey Global Institute

Megacity Taskforce

United Nations Population Division

IN THE NEWS

The whole of Eastern Africa is in a flux

Daily Nation 9 August 2013

IMF, World Bank report says urbanisation can lead to slums and crime

Ghana Business News 1 May 2013

Bangladesh Dhaka building collapse leaves 87 dead

BBC News 24 April 2013

Smog is altering childhood in China's cities

NDTV 23 April 2013

Model for megacities? Mexico City cleans up its air

Christian Science Monitor 22 April 2013

Indonesia's natural disaster risks, costs rise

IRIN 17 April 2013

Failures, tears, complaints, trail Lagos multi-billion Naira slums upgrade

Premium Times 14 April 2013

Surat beats metros with sharp drop in number of slum-dwellers

Indian Express 10 April 2013

Plastic waste time bomb ticking for India

Times of India 4 April 2013

East Asian Megacities' Acid Rain Downpours Call for Regulations

Medical Daily 3 April 2013

Rio gang-rape spotlights problem faced by developing-world cities

Christian Science Monitor 2 April 2013

Carbon Copy: Why China's Air-Pollution Problem Isn't Unique

Atlantic 21 March 2013

6 of 6

NOTES

Lagos 'Mega City' policy renders thousands homeless in Badia

Premium Times 28 February 2013

Amnesty: 3 out of every 4 people live in a slum

SW Radio Africa December 2012

From flying toilets to fertiliser, slum sanitation in Nairobi is changing

Guardian 19 November 2012

China's city dwellers to breathe unhealthy air 'for another 20-30 years'

Guardian 3 January 2012

Megacity Singapore under spotlight

BBC News 21 June 2011

Lagos aims to be Africa's model megacity

BBC News 22 January 2010

ABOUT DEBATING MATTERS

Debating Matters because ideas matter. This is the premise of the Institute of Ideas Debating Matters Competition for sixth form students which emphasises substance, not just style, and the importance of taking ideas seriously. Debating Matters presents schools with an innovative and engaging approach to debating, where the real-world debates and a challenging format, including panel judges who engage with the students, appeal to students from a wide range of backgrounds, including schools with a long tradition of debating and those with none.

DEBATING MATTERS
**TOPIC
GUIDES**

www.debatingmatters.com

FIND OUT MORE

Debating Matters engages a wide range of individuals, from the students who take part in the debates, the diverse group of professionals who judge for us, the teachers who train and support their debaters, and the young people who go on to become Debating Matters Alumni after school and help us to continue to expand and develop the competition. If you enjoyed using this Topic Guide, and are interested in finding out more about Debating Matters and how you can be involved, please complete this form and return it to us at the address below.

Debating Matters Competition
Academy of Ideas Ltd
Signet House
49-51 Farringdon Road
London
EC1M 3JP

- Yes, I'd like to know more. Please send me further information about the Debating Matters Competition:
- I am a teacher and would like further details about events in my area and how to enter a team
- I am a sixth form student and would like further details about events in my area
- I am interested in becoming a Debating Matters judge
- I am interested in sponsoring/supporting Debating Matters
- Other (please specify)

First name

Surname

School/company/
organisation

Professional role
(if applicable)

Address

Postcode

Email address

School/work phone

Mobile phone



**“DEBATING MATTERS
TEACHES A WAY
OF THINKING.
INTELLECTUAL
ARCHITECTURE
IS CREATED BY
ENGAGING WITH
IDEAS”**

TRISTRAM HUNT, HISTORIAN & BROADCASTER