

## TOPIC GUIDE: TOURISM

**"TOURISM BENEFITS THE WORLD"****PUBLISHED: 01 JAN 2007****AUTHOR: JAMES GLEDHILL**

Share this Topic Guide:

**INTRODUCTION**

Tourism has traditionally been a way of escaping the cares of the world, but mounting fears about the impact of mass tourism mean that tourists are now encouraged not to leave their consciences at home. A debate about whether mass tourism is exploitative [Ref: [BBC News](#)] has been going on for some time, leading to the rise of related ideas like ethical (dead link), [Ref: [Association of Independent Tour Operators](#)] or eco tourism [Ref: [Global Development Research Centre](#)]. However, recently the focus has switched from whether we should travel more responsibly to whether we should actually travel less. The increase in cheap flights is a particular focus of controversy. The Bishop of London has argued that it's selfish and sinful to contribute to climate change by flying on holiday, and that we should 'walk more lightly upon the earth' [Ref: [Times Online](#)]. Even the editors of backpackers' bibles Lonely Planet and Rough Guide have sought to discourage 'casual flying' [Ref: [Guardian](#)]. Carbon offsetting [Ref: [Wikipedia](#)] services, which seek to cancel out the carbon dioxide produced by flying, are increasingly popular. Gap years have also come in for criticism, with warnings that they may do more harm than good [Ref: [Guardian](#)]. There has, however, been a backlash against the war on tourism, with renewed arguments for the economic and social benefits tourism brings. Critics detect snobbery against mass tourism, moral posturing and hypocrisy, with people bemoaning the effects of tourism while continuing to take full advantage of its many benefits. They ask on what basis people claim a right to tell others how to enjoy themselves. The overall impact of tourism therefore needs to be reassessed, and the question remains: is the holiday over for mass tourism?

*For further reading use the menu bar on the right hand side.*

**DEBATE IN CONTEXT**

*This section provides a summary of the key issues in the debate, set in the context of recent discussions and the competing positions that have been adopted.*

**Is mass tourism exploitative?**

From the time that the father of mass tourism, Thomas Cook, organised the world's first package tour

in 1841, tourism has been more than the preserve of a privileged few. The post-war expansion of air travel kick started the era of international mass travel, which today, with the increase in cheap flights, includes many more short breaks alongside annual summer holidays. But tourism has many critics who accuse it of three main forms of exploitation: economic, environmental and cultural. There is disagreement about whether ethical tourism provides the answer, and it has its critics on both sides of the debate. On the for side there are those who argue all tourism is beneficial and that we shouldn't make moralising distinctions between different types of holiday. On the against side, some people question whether 'ethical' tourism is ever really possible. The debate is increasingly framed in terms of whether global tourism levels should be reduced.

### **Do the economic benefits outweigh the costs?**

Tourism is the world's largest industry and the only source of rapid development for many small developing countries. However, it's criticised for the way in which most of the money goes to companies abroad rather than local people. One side points to the benefits from employment and associated opportunities for small family businesses like cafes and handicrafts, while the other points to the large areas of land that are bought up by foreign companies, creating resorts which exclude local people and which tourists seldom leave.

### **Does tourism damage or improve the environment?**

Environmentalists argue flying is the fastest *growing* cause of climate change, although it is *currently* responsible for only three percent of greenhouse gas emissions. There are calls for a tax on aviation fuel to discourage flying. Budget airlines are a focus of criticism, but they argue that they are more efficient than other carriers. The debate over the effect on the environment of tourist destinations sets benefits like the creation of national parks, restoration of monuments and improved infrastructure against damage to coral reefs, pressure on water resources and the effects of golf courses and resorts on people and the landscape.

### **Does tourism undermine indigenous cultures or break down barriers?**

Our pursuit of the exotic, some say, is turning other cultures into consumer goods. Even independent travel is not immune from criticism, as it brings package tourists in its wake. Sex tourism is seen as indicative of rampant exploitation. Counter arguments say tourism promotes cultural understanding, even supposedly superficial package holidays. Trying to protect indigenous cultures, it's argued, denies them the benefits of development, treating them as museum pieces to be admired rather than active cultures to be engaged with.

### **Should we travel less?**

There are few voices making a positive case for travel. Previously, travel was associated with the way social progress afforded free time for individual leisure and even self-improvement. Travel was held to 'broaden the mind' and being 'well travelled' commanded respect. Now many people present a negative view: we're 'addicted to oil' and our disruptive restlessness undermines community life and threatens the planet. While some commentators argue that 'flying kills' [Ref: [Guardian](#)], and would welcome travel once again becoming an 'expensive luxury' [Ref: [Guardian](#)], others argue that we shouldn't lose sight of the remarkable opportunities travel affords us and that we should actually work to ensure that these can be enjoyed by more of the people of the world.

## **ESSENTIAL READING**

*It is crucial for debaters to have read the articles in this section, which provide essential information and arguments for and against the debate motion. Students will be expected to have additional evidence and examples derived from independent research, but they can expect to be criticised if they lack a basic familiarity with the issues raised in the essential reading.*

**International Commercial Surrogacy in India: Exploitation, Poverty, Alternatives and Survival** [🔗](#)

Mamata Nanda **Huffington Post** 3 October 2013

**Does Reproductive Tourism Treat Women Like Cattle?** [↗](#)

Dr. Raywat Deonandan **Huffington Post** 29 October 2012

**Assembling the Global Baby** [↗](#)

Tamara Audi and Arlene Chang **Wall Street Journal** 10 December 2010

**India, the Rent-a-Womb Capital of the World** [↗](#)

Amana Fontanella-Khan **Slate** 23 August 2010

**NHS restrictions prompt fertility tourism boom** [↗](#)

Sarah Boseley **Guardian** 30 June 2009

**Binoculars or beer: a tale of two tourists** [↗](#)

Justin Francis vs Jeremy Skidmore **The Times** 19 November 2005

**Feel-good travel: cheap flights: a force for good?** [↗](#)

Simon Calder vs Mark Lynas **Independent on Sunday** 19 June 2005

**Local v global: Do we need to travel so much?** [↗](#)

Jonathan Meades vs Peter Smith **The Future Cities Project** 27 February 2003

## FOR

**Airbnb in Berlin** [↗](#)

Airbnb **Airbnb** 5 December 2018

**In defense of tourism** [↗](#)

Peter Jon Lindberg **Peter Jon Lindberg** 3 September 2018

**Anti-tourism gets ugly** [↗](#)

Jim Butcher **Spiked** 22 August 2018

**In defense of being a tourist** [↗](#)

Lilit Marcus **CNN** 19 July 2017

**Dear 'Citizens of nowhere' you are not alone** [↗](#)

James Shackell **The Journal** 18 January 2017

**In defense of the three-week vacation** [↗](#)

Jynne Dilling **New York Times** 9 June 2016

**India's surrogate baby circus overlooks a vital part of the equation: The mother** [↗](#)

Amindita Majumdar **Daily Mail India** 15 July 2013

**Increasing concerns about surrogacy** [↗](#)

**University of Huddersfield** 17 January 2013

**A child of easy labour** [↗](#)

Kamayani B Mahabal **Tehelka** 8 June 2011

**Outsourcing Pregnancy: Just Another Job?** [↗](#)

Jennifer Lahl **The Centre for Bioethics and Culture Network** 20 January 2011

**Let us celebrate the freedom of flight** [↗](#)

James Panton **spiked** 16 August 2007

**Hot air? I want the cold facts** [↗](#)

Anatole Kaletsky, Stelios Haji-Ioannou and Micheal O'Leary **The Times** 10 June 2006

**I love cheap flights** [↗](#)

Brendan O'Neill **Guardian Comment is Free** 19 May 2006

**Stop this war on tourism** [↗](#)

Keith Jowett and Roger Wiltshire **Guardian** 3 March 2006

**Tourism enriches** [↗](#)

**World Tourism Organization (UNWTO)** 2 February 2004

**The misery behind the baby trade** [↗](#)

Daily Mail

## **AGAINST**

**When climate change is the reality, our grandchildren will look back in horror at how we travel** [↗](#)

Greg Dickinson **The Telegraph** 30 August 2018

**Residents in tourism hotspots have had enough. So what's the answer?** [↗](#)

Elle Hunt **The Guardian** 9 July 2018

**I don't mean to ruin your holiday, but Europe hates tourists – and with good reason** [↗](#)

Suzanne Moore **The Guardian** 16 August 2017

**In Berlin, a Grass-Roots Fight Against Gentrification as Rents Soar** [↗](#)

Charly Wilder **New York Times** 18 March 2017

**Airbnb vs. the city** [↗](#)

Megan Barber **Curbed** 10 November 2016

**Welcome to airspace** [↗](#)

Kyle Chayka **The Verge** 3 August 2016

**Six reasons why mass tourism is unsustainable** [↗](#)

Anna Pollock **The Guardian** 23 August 2013

**A Closer Look at Surrogacy** [↗](#)

Kendal Youngblood **Culture Wars** 27 June 2013

**The Real Deal on India's Gestational Surrogates** [↗](#)

**Global IVF** 25 May 2013

**Womb for Rent** [↗](#)

Mina Chang **Harvard International Review** 6 July 2009

**Donating a womb** [↗](#)

Uday Mahurkar **India Today** 13 September 2007

**Eco-tourism: A sustainable trade?** [↗](#)

James Mair **BBC News The Green Room** 14 December 2006

**This fear may at last rid us of the curse of hyper-mobility** [↗](#)

Simon Jenkins **Guardian** 16 August 2006

**Why we must give up flying** [↗](#)

Nicholas Crane **Daily Telegraph** 29 July 2006

**For the sake of the world's poor, we must keep the wealthy at home** [↗](#)

George Monbiot **Guardian** 28 February 2006

**Broadening the mind?** [↗](#)

**The Oxford Student** 22 November 2001

**Happy to rent a womb** [↗](#)

Hemlata Aithan **Oman Tribune**

## **IN DEPTH**

**A timeline of overtourism: key moments in the global battle between locals and travellers** [↗](#)

Greg Dickinson **The Telegraph** 5 May 2019

**How Berlin is fighting back against growing anti-tourist feeling in the city** [↗](#)

Oliver Stallwood **The Guardian** 4 December 2018

**Venice locals tear down turnstiles amid fury after they are segregated from tourists** [🔗](#)

Julia Buckley **Independent** 29 April 2018

**Living Next Door to Tourism in Berlin** [🔗](#)

Various **DW** 22 November 2017

**First Venice and Barcelona: now anti-tourism marches spread across Europe** [🔗](#)

Will Coldwell **The Guardian** 10 August 2017

**Here's exactly what Airbnb does to rent in popular cities** [🔗](#)

Jim Edwards **Business Insider** 20 October 2016

**How have our travel habits changed over the past 50 years?** [🔗](#)

Colin Pooley **The Conversation** 21 October 2015

**Surrogate motherhood: a critical perspective** [🔗](#)

Olga van den Akker **Expert Reviews** 2010

**The fertility tourists** [🔗](#)

Raekha Prasad **Guardian** 30 July 2008

**Foreign couples turn to India for surrogate mothers** [🔗](#)

Amelia Gentleman **New York Times** 4 March 2008

**Sun, sea and saving the world** [🔗](#)

Jim Butcher **spiked** 11 August 2005

**Hypermobility: too much of a good thing** [🔗](#)

John Adams **PIU Transport Seminar** 13 November 2001

## KEY TERMS

*Definitions of key concepts that are crucial for understanding the topic. Students should be familiar with these terms and the different ways in which they are used and interpreted and should be prepared to explain their significance.*

**A history of package holidays** [🔗](#)

Adam Lusher **Independent** 8 June 2015

**Carbon offset** [🔗](#)

**Eco-tourism** [🔗](#)

**Ethical tourism** [🔗](#)

**Mass tourism** [🔗](#)

**Responsible tourism** [🔗](#)

**Surrogacy** [🔗](#)

## BACKGROUNDEERS

*Useful websites and materials that provide a good starting point for research.*

**Thomas Cook** [🔗](#)

**Wikipedia** 14 November 2018

**Ghana after aid** [🔗](#)

Various authors **Financial Times** 8 October 2018

**'Overtourism' Is driving europeans crazy** [🔗](#)

Jessica Loudis **The Nation** 12 September 2018

**Your choice of holiday destination is a political act** [🔗](#)

Brendan Canavan **The Independent** 6 August 2018

**The backlash against Airbnb** [↗](#)

Charlemagne **The Economist** 19 July 2018

**The holiday destinations that are saving the planet** [↗](#)

Oliver Smith **The Telegraph** 5 June 2018

**Traveller vs tourist: The worst thing about being a travel snob** [↗](#)

Ben Groundwater **Stuff Magazine** 22 May 2018

**Tourism creates thorny ethical dilemmas: isn't that the point?** [↗](#)

Akshat Rathi **Quartz** 12 April 2018

**I did nothing all over the world** [↗](#)

Kate Manser **Medium** 5 March 2018

**In defence of the 'tourist trail'** [↗](#)

Jessica Lee **Lonely Planet** 18 February 2018

**Does your holiday pass the human rights test?** [↗](#)

Rebecca Seales **BBC** 7 February 2018

**The 'new' Gap Year: Is it worth it, and what should I do during my year before university?** [↗](#)

Flora Carr **The Telegraph** 16 August 2017

**Ethical Tourism and travelling off the beaten path** [↗](#)

Tobias Roberts **HuffPost** 6 July 2017

**In Defense Of Chinese Tour Groups** [↗](#)

Panpan Wang **Huffington Post** 2 May 2017

**It's time to wake up to the devastating impact flying has on the environment** [↗](#)

Roger Tyers **The Conversation** 17 January 2017

**No, tourism is not an act of 'white privilege'** [↗](#)

Jim Butcher **Spiked** 29 September 2016

**Surrogacy overseas** [↗](#)

HM Government 19 June 2013

**Are test-tube babies at greater health risk** [↗](#)

Cherrill Hicks **Telegraph** 10 February 2013

**Outsourcing Motherhood** [↗](#)

Prachi Bharadwaj **MightyLaws.in** 1 May 2011

**Film Review: Made in India** [↗](#)

**BioNews** 14 March 2011

**Do We Confuse Surrogacy With Prostitution?** [↗](#)

Paul Troop **Practical Ethics** 20 January 2011

**"They are just the wombs"** [↗](#)

Gina Maranto **Biopolitical Times** 6 December 2010

**"Made In India" preview: East meets West in the womb** [↗](#)

**Nature** 26 July 2010

**Inside India's Rent A Womb Business** [↗](#)

Scott Carney **Mother Jones** March 2010

**Is commercial surrogacy in India ethical?** [↗](#)

Naomi Canton **Hindustan Times** 9 December 2009

**More and more couples finding surrogates in India** [↗](#)

Mike Celizic **Today** 20 February 2008

**Surrogacy – Exploitation or Choice?** [↗](#)

**Cubically Challenged** 2008

**Surrogate Motherhood in India** [↗](#)

**Stanford University** 2008

**The Assisted Reproductive Technology (Regulation) Bill** [↗](#)

**PRS India** 2008

**‘A woman helping a woman! I love it!’** [↗](#)

Sheela Bhatt **Rediff India** 1 November 2007

**The slippery slope of winter sports** [↗](#)

Carmen de Jong **BBC News The Green Room** 6 August 2007

**Surrogate Mothers: Womb for Rent** [↗](#)

Abigail Haworth **Marie Claire** 29 July 2007

**International estimates of infertility prevalence and treatment-seeking** [↗](#)

Jacky Boivin, Laura Bunting, John A. Collins and Karl G. Nygren **Oxford Journals** 2 January 2007

**Talking heads: responsible travel** [↗](#)

Kate Humble, Ben Fogle and Alain de Botton **The Times** 10 June 2006

**Bhutan: the door slowly opens** [↗](#)

Cath Urquart **The Times** 8 January 2005

**Travellers who strive to do no harm** [↗](#)

Susan Llewelyn Leach **Christian Science Monitor** 22 December 2004

**Ecotourism – hope and reality**

Sue Wheat **peopleandplanet.net** 6 September 2004

**Tourism: the world’s blessing or curse?** [↗](#)

Lisa Mastny and Steve Conklin **Worldwatch Live Online Discussion** 23 June 2003

**Mass tourism: Is it exploitation?** [↗](#)

**BBC World Service Talking Point** 9 August 2001

**Economic impact of tourism** [↗](#)

**United Nations Environment Programme** 1 January 2001

**Tourism** [↗](#)

**Our Planet** February 1999

**Surrogacy: boon or bane** [↗](#)

Dr Alka Sehgal **wscpedia.org**

**The benefits and problems of ecotourism** [↗](#)

**UNESCO**

**The benefits and problems of mass tourism** [↗](#)

**UNESCO**

**Benefits and challenges of tourism** [↗](#)

**New Zealand Ministry of Tourism**

**Eco-tourism** [↗](#)

**Guardian**

**Mass tourism: environmental benefits and impacts** [↗](#)

**European Commission**

**Tourism and poverty reduction – a Cordaid issue** [↗](#)

**Cordaid**



**Adventures in tourism** [↗](#)

**BBC World Service**

## ORGANISATIONS

*Links to organisations, campaign groups and official bodies who are referenced within the Topic Guide or which will be of use in providing additional research information.*

**Earthwatch Institute** [↗](#)

**Global Surrogate Mother's Advancing Rights Trust** [↗](#)

**Lonely Planet** [↗](#)

Lonely Planet 16 November 2018

**Sama: Resource Group for Women and Health** [↗](#)

**Surrogacy India** [↗](#)

**Surrogacy UK** [↗](#)

**The Travel Foundation** [↗](#)

**Tourism Concern** [↗](#)

## IN THE NEWS

*Relevant recent news stories from a variety of sources, which ensure students have an up to date awareness of the state of the debate.*

**Majority of residents in favour of tourists** [↗](#)

Various **Visit Reykjavik** 5 November 2018

**Almost half of UK holidaymakers want tourism tax – survey** [↗](#)

Various **ITV** 4 November 2018

**Airlines hit out at increases in UK passenger taxes** [↗](#)

Josh Spero **Financial Times** 30 October 2018

**Leading ethical tourism charity forced to close** [↗](#)

Antonia Wilson **The Guardian** 28 September 2018

**Will you soon have to pay a tourist tax to visit the Scottish Highlands?** [↗](#)

Greg Dickinson **The Telegraph** 27 September 2018

**How is overtourism impacting travel to popular destinations?** [↗](#)

Johnny Jet **Forbes** 20 August 2018

**Furious Spanish locals turn on rowdy tourists who leave DRUGS in playgrounds** [↗](#)

Harriet Mallinson **The Express** 13 August 2018

**Selfies and sweat stains: bad holidays and bored tourists – in pictures** [↗](#)

Laurence Stephens **The Guardian** 31 July 2018

**Airbnb Drives Up Rent Costs in Manhattan and Brooklyn, Report Says** [↗](#)

Luis Ferré-Sadurní **New York Times** 3 May 2018

**Venice locals tear down turnstiles amid fury after they are segregated from tourists because city is** [↗](#)

Julia Buckley **Independent** 29 April 2018

**The Netherlands isn't as weed-friendly as it used to be** [↗](#)

Natasha Bach **Fortune** 17 April 2018

**The unstoppable rise of the Chinese traveller – where are they going and what does it mean for overt** [↗](#)

Oliver Smith **The Telegraph** 11 April 2018

**Cancún: from tourist beach paradise to hotbed of Mexico's drug violence** [↗](#)



David Agren **The Guardian** 14 March 2018

**12 destinations travellers might want to avoid in 2018** [↗](#)

Joe Minihane **CNN** 3 February 2018

**Where to go on holiday in 2018 – the hotlist** [↗](#)

Various **The Guardian** 6 January 2018

**Tourists have turned Oxford into ‘hell’, locals claim** [↗](#)

Natalie Paris **The Telegraph** 8 August 2017

**‘Tourism kills neighbourhoods’: how do we save cities from the city break?** [↗](#)

Elle Hunt **The Guardian** 4 August 2017

**Stats: millennials 5x more well-traveled than their grandparents** [↗](#)

Various **Travel Agent Central** 27 July 2017

**Why Amsterdam’s coffeeshops are closing** [↗](#)

Various **The Economist** 10 January 2017

**Airbnb faces worldwide opposition. It plans a movement to rise up in its defence** [↗](#)

Shane Hickey and Franki Cookney **The Guardian** 29 October 2016

**High Line neighbours hate “High Line tourists”** [↗](#)

Garth Johnston **Gothamist** 24 May 2016

**Couple who had twins tell of regret after embryo aborted in surrogacy** [↗](#)

**Independent** 13 January 2014

**India seeks to regulate its booming ‘rent-a-womb’ industry** [↗](#)

**Reuters** 30 September 2013

**Surrogate children in India deprived of mother’s milk** [↗](#)

**Hindu** 16 July 2013

**New project aims to train surrogate mothers for a second career** [↗](#)

**Daily Mail** 16 July 2013

**Israeli sex offender taps India’s booming surrogacy trade for baby girl** [↗](#)

**Global Post** 10 June 2013

**Govt set to allow visas to singles too for surrogacy** [↗](#)

**Indian Express** 28 May 2013

**Wombs for rent: Indian surrogate mothers tell their tales** [↗](#)

**NDTV** 25 February 2013

**Agents steal womb money** [↗](#)

**Times of India** 21 January 2013

**India bans foreign couples from surrogacy** [↗](#)

**Telegraph** 18 January 2013

**IVF couples forced to travel abroad by shortage of donors** [↗](#)

**Scotsman** 30 June 2011

**Foreign gay couples can’t have surrogate babies in India, says Home Ministry directive** [↗](#)

**India Today** 25 April 2011

**Young Bangalore girls donate their eggs for easy money** [↗](#)

**Times of India** 27 January 2011

**Fertility tourists eye Russia** [↗](#)

**Russia Today** 13 December 2010

**Variations in IVF laws fuel market for ‘fertility tourism’** [↗](#)

**New Zealand Herald** 14 September 2010

**No to pregnancy, yes to surrogacy for UK couples** [↗](#)

**Daily News Analysis** 14 May 2010

**Baby boom, baby bust** [↗](#)

**Telegraph India** 13 December 2009

**Barcelona declares war on stag and hen party binge drinkers with ban on Happy Hour** [↗](#)

**Telegraph** 15 October 2009

**Experts attack 'fertility tourism' industry** [↗](#)

**Dr.Malpani's Blog** 28 September 2009

**India Becoming Commercial Surrogacy Centre** [↗](#)

**Medindia** 1 January 2008

**Protests continue as Heathrow camp disbands** [↗](#)

**Guardian** 20 August 2007

**Germans stay home for eco-holiday** [↗](#)

**BBC News** 7 May 2007

**Roads group slaps down bishop who called gas guzzler cars sinful** [↗](#)

**Guardian** 24 July 2006

**It's a sin to fly, says church** [↗](#)

**The Sunday Times** 23 July 2006

**Boom in green holidays as ethical travel takes off** [↗](#)

**Guardian** 17 July 2006

**Are the benefits of tourism just skin deep?** [↗](#)

**Inter Press Service News Agency** 11 July 2006

**Euro MPs push for air fuel taxes** [↗](#)

**BBC News** 4 July 2006

**Soweto seeks its place in the sun** [↗](#)

**BBC News** 19 June 2006

**Concern over Antarctic tourists** [↗](#)

**BBC News** 19 June 2006

**Zambia beckons new wave of tourists** [↗](#)

**BBC News** 13 June 2006

**'Mass tourism threat to Morocco'** [↗](#)

**Daily Telegraph** 3 June 2006

**Oops, we helped ruin the planet** [↗](#)

**Guardian** 4 March 2006

**A nation of careless travellers** [↗](#)

**Daily Telegraph** 26 November 2005

**Climate threat to holiday hot spots** [↗](#)

**Daily Telegraph** 19 November 2005

**Travel agent launches 'guilt free' holidays** [↗](#)

**Times Online** 17 August 2005

**Tourism revival key for Maldives** [↗](#)

**BBC News** 7 February 2005

**Mind the gap: why student year out may do more harm than good** [↗](#)

Paul Brown **Guardian** 6 September 2003

**Pope condemns mass tourism** [🔗](#)

**BBC News** 23 June 2001

## AUDIO/VISUAL

This site contains links to websites operated by parties other than Debating Matters. Although we make every effort to ensure links are current, they will sometimes break after Topic Guide publication. If a link does not work, then the publication reference and date should enable you to find an alternate link. If you find a broken link do please send it to the **webmaster** for review.

© 2005-2021 debatingmatters.com: Debating Matters Competition, boi, Unit 208, Cocoa Studios, The Biscuit Factory, Drummond Road, London, SE16 4DG, UK

Tel +44 (0)20 3176 0827 - [dm@theboi.co.uk](mailto:dm@theboi.co.uk) | [admin login](#)